Supplementary materials B1: Topic and theme mapping coding instructions.

## Author note:

This document contains supplementary materials for the article titled:

*“We don’t ban you immediately for an offense”: Reddit moderation and the importance of repairing norm violations for high-quality online dialogue*

The document was created in deliberation between authors and then used to classify results of a topic model into hierarchical themes. The theme levels are: (1) – global theme, (1.1) – theme, (1.1.1) topic from topic model. A definition is provided for each global theme, theme, and topic.

# Moderation processes

*Definition:* Global theme relating to the procedural and organizational aspects of being a moderator.

## Operational moderation processes

## *Definition:* Theme relating to what the operational duties of a moderator (e.g., checking the mod queue, using auto-mod, interacting with users, etc.).

### 5\_Moderator operational dutie

### *Definition*: Topic relating to descriptions of day-to-day operational duties of moderators.

### 1\_User rule violations

### *Definition*: Topic relating to examples of users violating specific subreddit or site-wide rules.

### 12\_Auto-mod and bots in moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to descriptions of auto-moderator and other bot uses for current moderation practices.

14\_The worst parts of moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to descriptions and examples of the problems encountered whilst performing daily moderation duties.

16\_Subjectivity and lenience in moderation  
*Definition:* Topic relating to examples of moderators using subjective judgment during daily practice, including having lenience with rule violating users.

* 1. Managerial moderation processes

*Definition:* Theme relating to the managerial duties (e.g., communicating with other moderators, managing the hierarchy in moderators, equality of mod team, etc.).

* + 1. 6\_D.E.I. in moderation

*Definition*: Topic relating to descriptions and examples of ways the moderators deal with D.E.I. problems (e.g., racism/sexism in moderators)

* + 1. 7\_Hierarchy and Voting in Moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to descriptions of the hierarchy and voting mechanisms in moderation.

* + 1. 8\_Problems with moderator management

*Definition:* Topic relating to examples of difficulties in managing relationships between moderators.

* + 1. 9\_Managing research into subreddit

*Definition:* Topic relating to examples of ways moderators manage their relationship with researchers.

* + 1. 15\_Communication between moderators

*Definition:* Topic relating to descriptions and examples of moderator’s communications (e.g., using slack/discord, some/a lot of communication, etc.).

* 1. Subreddit rules

*Definition:* Theme relating to the written rules of a subreddit for users and moderators

* + 1. 3\_Details of subreddit rules

*Definition:* Topic relating to descriptions of a subreddit’s specific rules.

* + 1. 22\_Reddit rules about making money using a subreddit

*Definition:* Topic relating to examples of money-related rules for moderators and users (e.g., no advertising, no compensation for moderation, etc.).

1. **Reasons for moderation**

*Definition:* Global theme relating to the reasons moderation is needed.

* 1. Affordances of online dialogue

*Definition:* Theme relating to the features of online dialogue spaces (e.g., anonymous users, algorithmic content selection, etc.).

* + 1. 0\_Anonymity as online dialogue

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussions about how anonymity characterizes the difference between online and offline dialogue.

* + 1. 2\_The future of AI in moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussions about the future of technology and AI in moderation, including limitations of technology for capturing context in text-based dialogue.

* + 1. 10\_Social media amplifies ignorance and misinformation

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussions about social media enabling the spread of misinformation and ignorance with their social networking algorithms.

* + 1. 25\_Anarchy and chaos without moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to how anarchy and chaos would spread without moderation (e.g., 4chan).

* 1. Motivations for moderating

*Definition:* Theme relating to the motivations behind moderation practices (personal, social, practical, etc.).

* + 1. 8\_The necessity of moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussion of why moderation is needed in online dialogue.

* + 1. 9\_Moderation as encouraging good conversation

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussion of how moderation is done to encourage good conversation.

* + 1. 11\_Moderation as reducing harm

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussion of how moderation is done to reduce harm.

* + 1. 13\_Primary goal of moderation

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussion of moderators’ primary goal when moderating.

* + 1. 20\_Moderation to hold people accountable for their speech

*Definition:* Topic relating to discussion of how moderation is needed to hold people accountable for their speech (and thus limit free speech).

* + 1. 24\_Personal motivations for moderating

*Definition*: Topic relating to discussion of personal motivations of moderators for moderating (both in the speaker and observed in others).

* 1. Norms of online dialogue

*Definition:* Theme relating to the norms governing online dialogues.

* + 1. 4\_Free speech and its limitations

*Definition*: Topic relating to discussions of free speech.

* + 1. 17\_Features of high quality subreddits

*Definition*: Topic relating to discussions of what makes a high quality subreddit.

* + 1. 21\_The role of Reddiquette in moderation

*Definition*: Topic relating to discussions of the role of Reddiquette (e.g., as common sense).

23\_Anti-social behavior varies by context  
*Definition:* Topic relating to discussions about the variations in anti-social behavior in different subreddits and/or online dialogue spaces.